Penta Helix Collaboration in Developing Social Inclusion for Persons with Disabilities

Ismi Dwi Astuti Nurhaeni1*, Intan Sani Putri2, Asal Wahyuni Erlin Mulyadi3, Desiderius Priyo Sudibyo4

1Department of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia
2Master of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia
3Department of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia
4Department of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author Email: ismidwiastuti@staff.uns.ac.id

Received: 10 January 2023; Revised: 18 December 2023; Accepted: 20 December 2023

Abstract

This research examines collaboration between the government, community, academia, entrepreneurs and the media, known as the 'penta helix', in developing social inclusion for persons with disabilities (PwD) in Indonesia. This descriptive and qualitative study collects data through observation, focus group discussions and in-depth interviews. The research informants were determined purposively from representatives of the penta helix who were seen as understanding or having the authority to interact with PwD. For data analysis, Miles and Huberman's interactive analysis model was employed. Regarding the five areas of the penta helix, the study found that the government exercised political power through the issuance of Regional Regulation 9 of 2020 concerning the protection and fulfilment of the rights of PwD. The regulation aims to ensure that PwD receive the same rights and opportunities as other citizens. The community has a role as social power through creating care classes for PwD for people to understand the culture and self-development of PwD. Academics function as a knowledge power by developing campus inclusion standards and collaborating with national and international funding institutions to carry out the three pillars of higher education on the issue of PwD. Industry plays a role as social justice power in supporting the provision of venture capital assistance and work skills training for PwD. The media holds the power of brand image so that discriminatory views against PwD transform into fulfilling the rights of PwD. Understanding stakeholders' role in the penta helix collaboration helps develop a social inclusion model for PwD.

Keywords: Collaboration; Penta Helix; Persons with Disabilities; Social Inclusion

Copyright © 2024 by Authors, Published by Pusat Penelitian Ilmu Sosial dan Humaniora Kontemporer, Indonesia. This is an open access article under the CC BY-SA License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0).


Permalink/DOI: https://doi.org/10.46507/jcgpp.v5i1.105
Introduction

Persons with disabilities (PwD) include any person who experiences physical, intellectual, mental and sensory limitations for an extended period. Moreover, in interacting with the living environment, PwD may experience obstacles and difficulties in participating fully and effectively with other citizens on an equal rights basis. Types of PwD include physical disabilities in the form of impaired movement functions, as well as intellectual disabilities in the form of challenged thinking functions due to below-average intelligence levels (F. Antonak & Livneh, 2000). The number of PwD is quite large, with more than 1 billion (around 15%) of the world’s population having a disability (Martin Ginis et al., 2021). In Indonesia, the number of PwD is 12.15%, and only 51.12% participate in the workforce (ILO, 2018).

PwD often experience discrimination (Burke & Barnes, 2018; Demartoto, 2005; Fakh, 1999) in the health sector (Demartoto, 2005), education (Lestari et al., 2017; Sholeh, 2015), the economy (Indriyany, 2015; Lindsay et al., 2023), and the law (Wicaksana, 2017). Discrimination against PwD results in poor health services, low-quality education, reduced job prospects and limited social participation. Empirically, PwD can excel in various fields up to the international level. This success aligns with a shift in the disability paradigm from a ‘traditional model’, which is voluntary (charity), to an ‘individual model-medical model’ emphasising rehabilitation assistance (Santoso & Apsari, 2017). This model then becomes a ‘social model’ focusing on services for community change (Santoso & Apsari, 2017). Ultimately, the community’s mindset must be changed. In addition, the accessibility of PwD to activities in various developmental fields is vital (Krahn et al., 2006). Implementing an ‘inclusion model’ by bringing PwD into social life to accommodate their human rights is essential (Santoso & Apsari, 2017). With ratifying the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in 2011, the Indonesian government is working hard to eliminate discriminatory practices against PwD.

Although much research has been conducted on PwD, the novelty of this study lies in its application of the penta helix approach for PwD. Research on PwD includes identifying forms of government legal protection to fulfil the right to work for PwD in Indonesia and knowing how to create an inclusive work environment for PwD in Indonesia (Nurhayati, 2020). Kim and Zhu (2020) wrote about enhancing social inclusion for people with physical disabilities seen from the role of mobile social network applications by disability support organisations in China. In another work, Maini and Heera (2019) explored disability inclusion in organisations through a managerial lens. In 2015, Simplican et al. explained the definition of social inclusion for persons with intellectual disabilities and its development in terms of the ecological model of social networks and community participation. Meanwhile, Haug (2017) examined inclusive education both ideally and in reality. Little et al. (2020) investigated social inclusion from the perspective of students with disabilities, particularly regarding issues of friendship and acceptance. Loneliness in life stories by PwD was examined by Tarvainen (2021). Additional research includes a study on designing an accessibility portal for a higher
education institution (Allifya et al., 2022), and challenges and solutions in recruiting and retaining PwD for qualitative health research (Banas et al., 2019).

Studies on the penta helix model or using the approach have been carried out by several researchers, including Wisudayati et al. (2020), who researched the implementation of the penta helix collaborative model in developing the potential of government agencies as public service agencies. Maturbongs and Lekatompessy (2020) examined the penta helix collaboration in the development of local wisdom-based tourism. Castañer and Oliveira (2020) and Chamidah et al. (2021) describe the synergy of penta helix elements as an effort to develop tourism villages in Indonesia. Halibas et al. (2017) examined the penta helix innovation model and Sudiana et al. (2020) scrutinised the development and validation of penta helix construction. Subagyo (2021) analysed the implementation of the penta helix model for the terrorism deradicalisation programme in Indonesia. Additionally, Garcia and Cater (2022) examined the challenges for tourism partnerships in achieving ocean literacy. The seven studies above discussed the inclusion of PwD from economic, educational and health perspectives. Meanwhile, research on the penta helix discussing the development of social inclusion models for PwD has never been carried out.

This study examines collaboration between stakeholders in developing social inclusion for PwD from the penta helix perspective, namely collaboration between government, community, academia, business or entrepreneurs and the media. More specifically, this research aims to understand the five links in the penta helix collaboration in supporting the development of social inclusion in disability management. The penta helix collaboration occurs between the government as political power, the community as social power, academics as knowledge power, entrepreneurs as supporters of social justice power and the media as expanders (brand image power).

**Research Methods**

Research was conducted in the city of Surakarta because the city has been driven since 2017 to become one of the models of a disability-friendly city in Indonesia. In 2022, Surakarta was designated as the organiser of the Asian Para Games 2022. Consequently, Surakarta is considered to have a legacy as a disability-friendly city. In addition, Surakarta has been designated as a national training centre for athletes with disabilities. Surakarta’s success in hosting the Association of Southeast Asian Nations Para Games 2022, attended by 11 Southeast Asian countries, proves that Surakarta has collaborated among stakeholders, making it attractive for further research.

The research is descriptive and qualitative. Data were collected through observation, focus group discussion and documentation. Research informants were determined purposively from penta helix representatives who were seen as understanding or having experience or expertise in disabilities. The research informants included (1) Elements of the Surakarta City government, including the head of the Social Rehabilitation Division of the Surakarta City Social Service; the head of the Surakarta City Social Service Planning and Budgeting Sub-Coordinator; the Surakarta City Labour Office
and the Surakarta City Disabled Advocacy Team. (2) Community representatives, including the chairman of the Surakarta City Branch Leadership Council of Gerakan Untuk Kesejahteraan Tunarungu Indonesia (GERKATIN; Movement for the Welfare of the Indonesian Deaf), the Yayasan Pembinaan Anak Cacat (YPAC; Disabled Children Development Foundation), and Difa Sukses Mandiri. (3) From academia, the head of the Centre for Disability Studies at Universitas Sebelas Maret (UNS) was included. (4) For entrepreneurs, the PT. Tiga Serangkai Pustaka Mandiri company was selected, and from (5) the media, the following organisations were selected: solopos.com, genpi.co, radarsolo.jawapos.com, suaramerdeka.com and antaranews.com.

The analysis technique follows the model by Miles et al. (2014), and was carried out in three stages: data condensation, data presentation and forming conclusions. Data condensation involves sorting, focusing, simplifying, abstracting and transforming data from written field notes, interview transcripts, documents and other empirical materials (Miles et al., 2014). In this process, researchers select and summarise important data without changing meaning, focusing on sharpening data, looking for similar patterns and grouping data to then conclude at the end.

Data Collection

Data Display

Data Condensation

Conclusions: drawing/verifying

Figure 1. Interactive Model Data Analysis
Source: Miles et al. (2014)

After data condensation, the next stage is data presentation. The data are revealed by grouping previously selected and sorted data at the condensation stage to conclude (Miles et al., 2014). Data are presented by describing and connecting categories and then creating narrative text. The next step is concluding and verifying. Initial conclusions are temporary, which may change when going to the field to find other, more substantial evidence. When the conclusions made at the beginning are the same as the conclusions and are supported by valid evidence, the results obtained are quite credible. The stages of data analysis are depicted in Figure 1.
Results and Discussion

‘Collaboration’ is a term describing a pattern of cooperative relations carried out by more than one party (Wang & Ran, 2023). The basis of collaboration is the principle of togetherness, cooperation, sharing of tasks, equality and responsibility (Lopes & Farias, 2022). Collaboration is joint involvement in a coordinated effort to solve problems together. Characteristics of collaborative interactions include common goals, a symmetrical structure with high-level negotiations through joint activities and interdependence (Albers et al., 2016; Castañer & Oliveira, 2020; Simplican et al., 2015; Whitford et al., 2010). Collaboration is not limited by a particular time or period – it is still needed if affairs have an allusion or intersection with other parties. Collaboration involves several parties, starting from the individual level, work groups and the organisation (Anderson & McFarlane, 2019; Whitford et al., 2018).

Note that collaboration has a protracted timeframe. As a process, collaboration is an ongoing interaction between several people. In conducting collaboration, joint planning is needed so that its implementation becomes a shared responsibility. This view aligns with scholars indicating that collaboration is a complex process requiring knowledge-sharing that is planned, intentional and a shared responsibility (Komninos & Kakderi, 2019; Lindeke & Sieckert, 2005; Muklis et al., 2022). In essence, collaborators aim to achieve common goals by helping each other. The purpose of collaboration is to accelerate the achievement of goals together. Even in reaching these goals, it is inadvisable to compartmentalise the tasks in charge. In this study, collaboration was carried out by the government, the community, businesspeople, universities and the mass media.

Government as Political Power

In carrying out its role as political power, the Surakarta City government has proclaimed itself a disability-friendly, socially inclusive city since 2010. Surakarta, which identifies itself as a city friendly to PwD, has substantiated this assertion through the enactment of several legislations, including Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2008 concerning disability equality, Mayor’s Regulation Number 9 of 2013 for implementing this equality law, Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2020 for the protection of PwD rights, and the Mayor’s Decree of 2021 regarding social assistance for the elderly and PwD.

These regulations are the basis for the Surakarta City government in developing various activities that provide benefits for PwD, such as Mobile Social Service Units, Providing additional food for PwD, social rehabilitation and collaboration with organisations working in the disability sector, such as the Disability Advocacy Team and YPAC. At the Mobile Social Service Unit, the Surakarta City government collects data on disability needs according to type. Next, recommendations for mobility assistance or hospital referrals are provided for people with disabilities. The Surakarta City government is also developing a Programme for Providing Additional Food for PwD per their disability criteria every three months. The Surakarta City government has also developed a social rehabilitation programme for people with physical disabilities at the
The research findings show that the government acts as a political force through the development of policy and product innovations. This view aligns with Bartley (2022), who maintain that the government acts as a regulator with political power that produces regulatory policies and encourages innovation. Regarding social inclusion, policy innovation is manifested by regulating social inclusion services and encouraging product innovation by building physical infrastructure and providing facilitators for PwD.

Society or Community as Social Power

The Branch Leadership Council of GERKATIN in Surakarta City is a unique community for the deaf. One of the activities of the Leadership Council of the GERKATIN Branch in Surakarta City is to make classes a place of learning for the community, especially the deaf (deaf friends), to broaden their horizons and improve their abilities so they can understand the culture of deaf friends and self-development for deaf friends. Aimed at deaf friends and the general public, one of the classes offered is Bahasa Isyarat Indonesia (BISINDO; Indonesian sign language).

Surakarta City has a community for PwD, namely Difa Sukses Mandiri (DSM) and Persatuan Tunanetra Indonesia (PERTUNI; Indonesian Blind Association) Surakarta. DSM is a community-based enterprise with disabled members. The community objectives of DSM are to create independence, economic welfare and improve quality of life by increasing competence, self-confidence and workforce opportunities for PwD. The collaboration between DSM and the Surakarta City government includes outreach and training for PwD in cooking, sewing, workshop training, IT training and family financial management. In addition, training is provided by social institutions regarding advocacy and the protection of children and women with disabilities.

PERTUNI is a national-level blind community-based organisation. The PERTUNI Surakarta City Branch has 35 active members. PERTUNI’s goals are to create conducive conditions for blind people to carry out their lives as individuals and citizens who are intelligent, independent and productive without discrimination in all aspects of life and livelihood. The form of collaboration by PERTUNI and the Surakarta City Government includes consolidating efforts to encourage open access to facilities and support for disabilities regarding financial assistance. PERTUNI also works with the Komisi Pemilihan Umum (KPU; General Election Commission) and Badan Pengawas Pemilihan Umum BAWASLU; General Election Supervisory Body) Surakarta City regarding the accessibility of election facilities and providing input regarding election venues, ballot cards and braille templates.

This work’s findings show that the community acts as a social force by developing cohesiveness among PwD, enabling the development of a disability self-concept and serving as a facilitator between universities, the business world, government and the media. This social force is shown in the community by facilitating forums, conducting social activities, disseminating regulations on disabilities, evaluating needs and offering skills training for PwD. Society as a social force can be achieved through public values.
based on deliberative thinking without isolating certain groups (Windiani, 2021). These public values must come from the social collectivity of people who act together in the public space accompanied by democratic dialogue about common interests.

Academics as Knowledge Power

Universitas Sebelas Maret (UNS) is one of the universities in Surakarta with a focus on PwD. UNS implements a disability-friendly policy and does not discriminate against PwD. As an inclusive tertiary institution, UNS continues to provide equal space for PwD to participate in the selection to enter tertiary institutions with various entry routes and supporting facilities. UNS has a Center for Disability Studies, which is expected to become a centre of excellence for science and technology, realising UNS as an inclusive tertiary institution in 2024. The Center for Disability Studies also collaborates with domestic and foreign agencies.

UNS has established standards for education quality service, which include student service standards as part of education quality, adherence to inclusive campus standards, acceptance of disability-independent pathways, compliance with Law Number 8 of 2016 as per the UNS Chancellor's Decree, and the promotion of an inclusive campus through the development of the Inclusive Campus Index instrument, aimed at enhancing UNS's higher education ranking in 2022.

Collaboration between the Center for Disability Studies and its partners includes (1) expanding access to education together with the National Commission on Disabilities, as well as digitalisation in developing applications for improving teacher technology, and (2) Cooperation with the central government, namely conducting training for teachers in regular schools for inclusive education competencies. Academics play the role of knowledge power by developing innovations to improve disability access and conducting studies to support disability self-development. As Muhyi and Chan (2017) submit, academics are a source of knowledge in the penta helix, with concepts and theories for developing businesses to gain a sustainable competitive advantage.

Entrepreneurs as Supporters of Social Justice Power

Based on the results of interviews with the Surakarta City Manpower Office, private companies are required to employ at least 1% of PwD from the number of employees or workers by the provisions of Article 53 of Law Number 8 of 2013. However, this requirement still needs improvement and implementation due to a need for more applicants. In addition, the limited skills and competencies possessed by PwD make it difficult for them to obtain job opportunities according to the needs of the labour market. The triggering for PwD to be reluctant to apply for jobs is the addition of a requirement to possess a competency training certificate. Moreover, the private sector and industry consider that accepting PwD as workers will hinder company performance. A disability-friendly work environment has not yet been implemented, which is the reason it is difficult for PwD to get jobs even though companies that do not implement the 1% policy on disabled workers will receive sanctions.
Although only a few companies accept workers with disabilities, Tiga Serangkai Pustaka Mandiri is one of the private companies in Surakarta City that provides opportunities and attention to workers with disabilities. This company received an appreciation award for employing three employees with disabilities. One of the programmes from the Mandiri Libra Triad is spiritual building training. The programme aims to increase the spiritual intellect of trainees, most of whom are PwD.

Collaborations between the Surakarta City government and entrepreneurs in Surakarta City include (1) providing business capital assistance to 10 PwD through the Sufism programme, namely cash assistance of two million rupiahs, and (2) work skills training for PwD. The Surakarta City government has appointed 11 companies that accept employees with disabilities. The programme is called 3 in 1, which consists of skills training, certification and job placement for PwD. The industrial companies that cooperate in this programme are the garment, textile and footwear industries because these industries are considered able to absorb the most labour.

This work shows that entrepreneurs play a role as a force for social justice through providing employment opportunities for PwD and corporate social responsibility for developing the quality of life of PwD. The activities include business capital assistance and work skills training for disabled persons. The role of entrepreneurship as a force for social justice is in line with the opinion of Jabeen et al. (2023), where the industry creates entrepreneurship participants, products, technology and drivers of innovation in accelerating change.

Media as an Expander (Brand Image Power)

The media not only chooses events and determines news sources but also plays a role in compiling and defining the reality of various events that occur. Through this process, information becomes helpful for the public and can determine how people see and understand events. Generally, the mass media does three things when forming public opinion. First, the media uses symbols to generate recognition. Second, the media carries out a message packaging strategy (framing). Third, the media sets the agenda to determine the priority of which messages are conveyed to the audience (Hammad, 2004; Huang et al., 2021; Kiryakova et al., 2020). Disability issues are often considered trivial, unimportant and uninteresting to discuss (Cheyne, 2019; Mason, 1990). The media often misrepresents disability issues, which creates stereotypes in society that affect social positions and public policies regarding the fulfilment of the rights of PwD (Canton et al., 2023). Five online media outlets were used in this study, namely solopos.com, genpi.co, radarsolo.jawapos.com, suaramerdeka.com and antarnews.com. News from the five online media outlets is seen from the perspective of the needs of PwD in Surakarta City in 2018–2022.

Figure 2 illustrates the number of disability-related issues published in daily newspapers, with the highest number being reported by Antara News. Antaranews.com is the media outlet in 2018–2022 containing the most issues on the needs of people with disabilities, amounting to 224 news items. Meanwhile, genpi.co at least raises the issue of
disability needs in 16 stories. Based on a content analysis of media coverage, it was found that news coverage about services for PwD was either positive or negative.

Figure 2. Reporting on Disability by the Media in Surakarta City from 2018 to 2022
Source: Processed by Authors (2023)

Table 1. Content Analysis of Media Coverage
Source: Processed by Authors (2023)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criticism</th>
<th>Positive Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-) Criticism of the city government’s inability to facilitate the needs of PwD.</td>
<td>(+) Positive information about trials of disabled-friendly buses with low deck models and facilities for the blind and walking letters that make it easier for the deaf.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Criticism of employers who set high standards and negative stigma for PwD so that their accessibility to get jobs is hampered.</td>
<td>(+) Positive appreciation for the government, which protects persons with disabilities using traditional markets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Criticism of the Electric Rail Train (KRL) service provider agency (PT KCI), which refused to allow the disabled to board the KRL because it was not in accordance with procedures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Criticism of the behaviour of people who misuse sidewalks for PwD as a place to trade.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 indicates that the media is advocating through sharp criticism or appreciation of the government, employers or the public so they are non-discriminatory and more responsive to the needs of PwD. The media is also a bridge to influence policymakers in formulating policies responsive to the interests of PwD.

The media play the role of expander (brand image power) by promoting social inclusion for PwD and encouraging the formation of disability-friendly villages. This promotion role is echoed by Muhyi and Chan (2017), who claim that the media is the stakeholder with a vital role in promoting and developing business. The activities carried out by the media include conducting policy advocacy on disability issues and influencing lawmakers in formulating strategic policies that ensure disability rights. The overall relationships in the penta helix regarding social inclusion for PwD are depicted in Figure 3.

Figure 3. Penta Helix Approach to Social Inclusion for Persons with Disabilities
Source: Processed by Authors (2023)
The penta helix collaboration model in social inclusion clearly illustrates that the government as a political power develops policy and product innovations that provide facilities for PwD. Furthermore, society as a social force develops public values without isolating certain special-needs groups (Windiani, 2021). Academics as a knowledge power develop businesses to gain a sustainable competitive advantage by developing an inclusive campus. Meanwhile, entrepreneurship as a social justice power provides job opportunities to develop the quality of life of PwD. Finally, the media acts with the power of brand image, promoting the paradigm of social inclusion for PwD and encouraging the formation of disability-friendly villages. Furthermore, the media influences policymakers to view fulfilling disability rights as a strategic policy issue. This collaborative model complements previous studies that have not explicitly discussed PwD.

Conclusion

This study revealed a penta helix collaboration between the Surakarta City government, the community, academics, entrepreneurs and the media in developing social inclusion for PwD. In this collaboration, the government plays a role in exercising political power through its issuance of Regional Regulation 9 of 2020 concerning the protection and fulfilment of the rights of PwD with the aim that PwD get the same rights and opportunities as other citizens. The community has a role as a social power by creating care classes for PwD so that people understand the culture and self-development of PwD. Academics serve in a knowledge power function by developing campus inclusion standards and collaborating with national and international funding institutions to carry out the three pillars of higher education in Indonesia on the issue of PwD. Industry functions as a social justice power in supporting the provision of venture capital assistance and work skills training for PwD. Lastly, the media holds the power of brand image so that discriminatory views against PwD turn into fulfilling the rights of PwD. Understanding stakeholders’ roles in the penta helix collaboration helps develop a social inclusion model for PwD.

Acknowledgement

The authors would like to thank Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia, which has provided funding through Non-APBN Fundamental Research.

References


ILO. (2018). *Mempromosikan Hak dan Kesempatan bagi Penyandang Disabilitas di Indonesia (Kemitraan PBB untuk Mempromosikan Hak Penyandang Disabilitas/UNPRPD)*. ILO.


